

PODEM - DPI Comparative Study Visit: “Towards Advocating Police Monitoring Mechanisms in Turkey”

An exploration of police reforms and policing oversight in Great Britain and Northern Ireland

Supported by the Raoul Wallenberg Institute of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law

9-13 May 2016, London and Belfast

Summary Report



PODEM – DPI participants with Northern Ireland’s Police Ombudsman, Dr Michael Maguire in Belfast

Foreword

The following is a summary of the discussions that took place during PODEM and DPI's recent Comparative Study Visit to Great Britain and Northern Ireland. This comprised a series of roundtable meetings in London and Belfast from 9 to 13 May 2016, addressing the topic of *'Towards Advocating Police Monitoring Mechanisms in Turkey'* through an exploration of policing accountability and oversight bodies in the contexts of Great Britain's and Northern Ireland's experiences. This visit took place on the brink of the very recent bill on the establishment of a "Law Enforcement Oversight Commission" in Turkey that passed as a part of the 73 criteria Turkey is required to meet under the recent EU Accession process. While this has not sparked extensive public debate and interest on policy and practice in relation to police monitoring mechanisms in Turkey, the issue has however been on Turkey's agenda through the EU Progress Reports on Turkey's membership.

The aim of the visit was therefore to address the challenges related to establishing such a body, including overcoming bureaucratic limitations, issues related to impunity, and deciding on a structure that answers the needs of a diverse and historically divided society. Our objective in bringing together experts and practitioners in the field of police reform and oversight within Turkey, including academics from Turkey's Police Academy, was to gain insight into the mechanisms and practices necessary to achieve robust police accountability structures, and to acquire in-depth knowledge of the criteria for success and best practice in this area.

Both PODEM and DPI hope to carry out further activities focusing on related topics in the coming months as part of their respective work on democratic processes.

Working papers relating to some of the key topics addressed in this report, including resources provided by speakers in this visit can be found at the end of this report. This activity was held under Chatham House Rule. For a detailed record of the discussions that took place during the visit please contact info@democraticprogress.org or beril.bahadir@podem.org.tr

Contextual analysis: responding to the need to address police accountability and democratisation of citizen - police relations

Identifying the need for a platform for dialogue and discussion in the area of police accountability in Turkey, the sessions that took place with relevant experts and practitioners during this five-day visit focused on the mechanisms employed in the contexts of Great Britain and Northern Ireland to bring about police reform and to ensure accountability and monitoring of policing. The visit brought together academics from Turkey's Police Academy, as well as academics and civil society members currently engaged in areas related to police accountability and the normalisation and democratisation of citizen – police relations in Turkey.



Participants with Kate Lloyd and Adrian Griffiths of Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary's (HMIC) Legitimacy Portfolio Team in London

The primary objective of the delegation was to conduct a full assessment of the policing landscapes in both Great Britain and Northern Ireland and to examine all aspects of police reforms that have taken place in both contexts, as well as the current mechanisms that are in place aiming to ensure robust police accountability. In the case of Northern Ireland, police reform and accountability mechanisms were analysed from a post-conflict perspective, which was of particular interest given the relevance to Turkey's own Kurdish conflict. In the case of the UK, two successful oversight models, namely the Independent Police Complaint Commission (IPCC) and Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (HMIC) were examined.



PODEM – DPI participants meet with Professor Mike Hough, Associate Director of the Institute for Criminal Policy Research (ICPR) at London’s Birkbeck University, to discuss police reform and accountability mechanisms in the context of Great Britain, during a roundtable held at DPI’s offices in London

Through examining a selection of themes drawn from these two experiences of police and justice reform and monitoring, participants taking part in the visit gained a comprehensive understanding of the challenges and obstacles faced in bringing about transformation in this area and in establishing robust accountability and oversight mechanisms within policing. Of particular relevance were learnings from within the conflict/post-conflict scenarios explored in Northern Ireland, and the ways in which such difficulties were overcome in terms of reforming policing there to democratise community – police relations. The architecture and design of oversight mechanism models were examined in detail with those with first hand experience of the technicalities of their implementation in practice. Through analysing these experiences and ongoing learnings from these comparative case studies by meeting with experts, practitioners and policy makers in all areas of police accountability and oversight as well as policing and justice reform in the context of conflict resolution, participants left the visit with a strong knowledge base in the areas covered.



PODEM – DPI participants with Paul Nolan of the Northern Ireland Policing Board at the NIPB Offices in Belfast

Themes explored

Themes addressed during the visit include the reasons behind police reform and the need for policing oversight mechanisms and structures; the challenges faced in establishing such mechanisms and the ways in which these can be overcome; police reform as part of conflict resolution and transitional justice – “dealing with the past”; the inclusion of police reform within peace negotiations and agreements; the role of civil society in fostering positive citizen/community and police relations and developing confidence in policing; the role of police reform and accountability within security sector reform (SSR) more generally; the practicalities of implementing policing accountability; policing and politics – the question of how to depoliticise the police while remaining representative of all sectors of society; police training curricula; partnerships between police and other public authorities including on cross border security; steps to change the internal culture and dynamics of policing; issues of gender and policing and the incorporation of gendered perspectives into policing; the criteria for police oversight mechanism members such as a policing board; the role of international third parties in assisting with police reform and accountability mechanisms; positive approaches to security and public order; legal status of police oversight mechanisms; questions of funding and resources; the importance of public reporting by police oversight mechanisms themselves; transformation of public perceptions of the police; components of police reform including use of symbols and emblems, names, terminology; reform of police recruitment methods; and the technicalities of police reform programmes such as severance schemes.

Participants

The visit was attended by 8 participants, including representatives from both PODEM and DPI, as well as experts in the field of police reform and accountability, and academics from Turkey's Police Academy. As well as meeting with speakers from the office of the Northern Ireland Police Ombudsman, the Northern Ireland Policing Board, the UK's Independent Police Complaints Commission (IPCC), Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (HMIC), the Northern Ireland Office and the Department of Justice, as well as former senior police officers and experts in the area of police reform, participants took part in a field trip to the interface areas of Belfast, and met with former political prisoners from both Nationalist and Unionist communities, to gain deeper insight into the historical context of Northern Ireland's conflict.

Police accountability and oversight mechanisms – lessons learned from Great Britain and Northern Ireland

Speakers in the visit included government officials from the British Government's Northern Ireland Office, the Northern Ireland Department of Justice, representatives from the office of the Northern Ireland Police Ombudsman, representatives from the Northern Ireland Policing Board, former senior police officers including Chief Superintendents, civil society actors and community leaders focusing on community – police relations, representatives from the UK's Independent Police Complaints Commission (IPCC) and Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (HMIC), and experts and academics focused on police and justice reform and oversight.



PODEM – DPI participants meet with members of Intercomm Ireland, a civil society organisation in Belfast working to improve police – community relations and engaged in police training

Speakers shared in detail with participants on their first hand experiences and insights, and time was dedicated to question and answer led discussion. Some of the key topics that arose include *police and justice reform as a key component of conflict resolution and democratic transition processes*; the experiences of Northern Ireland were drawn on in this sense, and participants learned in detail of the Independent Commission on Policing for Northern Ireland, established in 1998 as part of the Good Friday Agreement, and producing the Patten Report, which offered 175 recommendations on reforms to be made to the Royal Ulster Constabulary (now the Northern Ireland Police Service).



PODEM – DPI participants during a private tour of Belfast's interface areas, including a memorial garden near the Shankill Road

This provided the opportunity for discussion on the role of third party actors and comparative international experiences in police reform, and examples gained by the Commission from various international models of police reform including those of Canada, South Africa, Spain and the US were discussed.

Implementation of the various reforms discussed was a reoccurring topic addressed during the visit, and speakers shared on the challenges of realising change in practice. Participants gained in-depth understanding of the central place policing played (and continues to play) in the Northern Ireland peace process, and learned of the work that followed the signing of the agreement to establish police reform, including through the work of the Commission, culminating in the devolution of policing and justice powers from Westminster to Northern Ireland in 2010.

The role of the police in dealing with the past and “legacy issues” was discussed during the visit, including the interaction between transitional justice mechanisms and the police service, and the question of accountability in this area was examined in detail.



Richard Lemon of the Northern Ireland Office’s Security and Protection Group and Ian Kerr of Northern Ireland’s Department of Justice, discuss the process of devolution of policing and justice and the role of police reform and accountability within the Good Friday Agreement and subsequent agreements including the Fresh Start Agreement, during a roundtable meeting at Stormont House

Speakers shared on the technicalities of policing accountability mechanisms examined, including composition (to be reflective of society's makeup), structure, management, and so forth.

The practical and symbolic changes experienced within policing reform models were addressed, including changes to symbols and emblems, name, uniform and other visible aspects of the police force, which reflected the evolution of the police in Northern Ireland into a neutral authority representative of, and serving, all of society.



Former PSNI Chief Superintendent and Belfast City Council's Director of City and Neighbourhood Services Nigel Grimshaw addresses PODEM-DPI participants during a roundtable on policing accountability in Northern Ireland

Much discussion centred on the issue of police training, and the important role this can play in terms of changing the internal culture and dynamics of policing. Speakers shared on the form police training takes in Great Britain and Northern Ireland and described its contribution to the normalisation of community – police relations. Participants met with trainers and civil society actors experienced in the re-education of police officers, and learned about the curricula (which provides for education on police accountability mechanisms) and entry criteria for police training schools in Northern Ireland.



Former Assistant Chief Constable and current Chief Executive of Co-operation Ireland, Peter Sheridan OBE, discusses his previous experiences as the most senior Catholic police officer in the PSNI and the challenges faced in enforcing police reform in Northern Ireland

Another key theme addressed was importance of community engagement with the police. Civil society leaders and representatives shared about the role they have played in fostering stronger relations between the public and the PSNI, in particular in the interface areas of Belfast. Speakers also described the way in which reforms undertaken (following the Good Friday Agreement and the subsequent Patten Commission's report) to make the police service more balanced and representative of society, including the temporary enforcement of an affirmative action policy to ensure that both Protestant and Catholics were recruited with equal opportunity and without discrimination. This was seen to be an important contributing factor in transforming historical perceptions and in gaining wider acceptance of the police service from both ends of the political spectrum in Northern Ireland.

Speakers discussed in detail the technicalities of policing oversight mechanisms and the structure of reformed police service today, including aspects relating to senior appointments, ground level recruitment, reporting and hierarchy, composition, and budgetary issues.



PODEM – DPI participants meet with Northern Ireland’s Police Ombudsman Dr Michael Maguire, and Paula Cunningham, Deputy Senior Investigations Officer to discuss the role of the NIPO in policing accountability and oversight

Key points of discussion in relation to Great Britain and Northern Ireland’s experience include:

- The central importance of police reform and accountability in democratic transition and conflict resolution processes;
- The challenges faced in incorporating policing issues into peace agreements;
- The technicalities involved in establishing policing accountability mechanisms such as a Police Ombudsman, Policing Board and Independent Complaints Commission;
- Political questions arising in the area of police accountability and keeping policing independent of politics;
- The relationship between the police and the armed forces;
- Budgetary and fiscal aspects of police reform and accountability;
- The role of symbols, emblems and language within police reform;
- The role of civil society in fostering community engagement with the police services and the concept of “policing with the community”;
- The role of third parties in instigating police reform eg. through Commissions, Inquiries and Reports (such as the Patten Report);
- The practicalities of implementing internal cultural change within police services;
- Structure and processes of police accountability and oversight mechanisms;
- Introduction and implementation of Human Rights principles as a basis for police reform and accountability;
- The role of the police in the area of transitional justice and “dealing with the past”.

Visit outcomes

The comparative study visit to London and Belfast was successful in having laid the groundwork for ongoing discussion on thematic topics related to police reform and accountability and serves as a basis for follow up activities that are intended to take place in future to allow for dialogue to continue on this important area. The UK is seen to be a useful case study in this area, offering diverse experiences on many relevant topics. The various policing accountability and oversight models within Northern Ireland offer many insights into this subject area, and the Northern Irish example of police reform within SSR more widely is one which is globally recognised as a positive model to be drawn on in other cases. It is hoped that the discussions that took place during this visit will serve to promote further dialogue on this issue in Turkey and beyond.

Contents: Annexes

Annex 1	14
Delegation	14
Speakers	14
Annex 2	16
Resources and further reading	16

Annex 1

Delegation

Name	Position	Affiliation
Hayal Akarsu	PhD Candidate, University of Arizona	University of Arizona
Beril Behadır	Project Coordinator	PODEM
Özge Genç	Research Director	PODEM
Eleanor Johnson	Deputy Director – Director of Programmes	Democratic Progress Institute
Ayşe Çolpan Kavuncu	Academic, Police Academy of Turkey	Police Academy of Turkey
Nur Kırmızıdağ	PhD Candidate, Johns Hopkins University, PODEM Research Affiliate	Johns Hopkins University, PODEM
Ahmet Erkan Koca	Academic, Police Academy of Turkey	Police Academy of Turkey
Bayram Ali Soner	Academic, Police Academy of Turkey	Police Academy of Turkey

Speakers

Name	Position	Affiliation
Paula Cunningham	Deputy Senior Investigations Officer	Police Ombudsman for Northern Ireland, Belfast
Adrian Griffiths	Legitimacy Portfolio Team Representative	Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (HMIC), London
Nigel Grimshaw	Former Chief Superintendent, PSNI and Director of City & Neighbourhood Services Department	Belfast City Council, Belfast
Professor Mike Hough	Associate Director	Institute for Criminal Policy Research (ICPR), Birkbeck University, London
Winston Irvine	Trainer	Intercomm Ireland, Belfast
Ian Kerr	Department of Justice	Northern Ireland Government
David Knight	Director of Strategy and Impact	Independent Police Complaints Commission (IPCC), London
Noel Large	Former political prisoner and tour guide	Spectrum, Belfast
Richard Lemon	Security and Protection Group	Northern Ireland Office, Stormont House, Belfast
Kate Lloyd	Legitimacy Portfolio Team Representative	Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (HMIC), London
John Loughran	Programme Director	Intercomm Ireland
Dr Michael Maguire	Police Ombudsman for Northern Ireland	Police Ombudsman for Northern Ireland, Belfast
Liam Maskey	Executive Director	Intercomm Ireland, Belfast
Dr Joanne Murphy	Expert and Author on Policing reform in Northern Ireland	Institute for the Study of Conflict Transformation and

		Social Justice ((ISCTSJ), Queen's University, Belfast
Paul Nolan	Independent Board Member	Northern Ireland Policing Board, Belfast
Ciara O'Neill	Communications Officer	Northern Ireland Policing Board, Belfast
Peter Sheridan OBE	Former Assistant Chief Constable, PSNI and Chief Executive	Co-operation Ireland, Belfast
Peadar Whelan	Former political prisoner and tour guide	Coiste, Belfast

Annex 2

Resources and further reading

- DPI overview of the Good Friday Agreement in English and Turkish:
<http://www.democraticprogress.org/publications/the-good-friday-agreement-an-overview/>
- Policing for Peace in Northern Ireland – Change, Conflict and Community Confidence, Dr Joanne Murphy (Palgrave) <http://www.palgrave.com/us/book/9780230291997>
- Patten Report on Policing – Summary of Recommendations:
<http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/issues/police/patten/recommend.htm#prof>
- Police Ombudsman report on public perceptions of the NIPO
- Policing with the community report – Criminal Justice Inspection Northern Ireland
<http://www.cjini.org/CJNI/files/cc/caae1ea9-133f-4199-8c29-0ff8b48206b6.pdf>
- Intercomm’s 2014 report “Reflections on the Northern Ireland experience: The lessons underpinning the normalisation of policing and security in a divided society”:
<http://www.saferworld.org.uk/resources/view-resource/818-reflections-on-the-northern-ireland-experience>
- Civilian Oversight of Police – Advancing Accountability in Law Enforcement, Tim Prenzler (CRC Press): <https://www.crcpress.com/Civilian-Oversight-of-Police-Advancing-Accountability-in-Law-Enforcement/Prenzler-Heyer/p/book/9781482234183>
- Presentation made by David Knight from Independent Police Complaints Commission (IPCC):
<http://podem.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/IPCC-2016.pdf>
- Presentation made by the Northern Ireland Police Ombudsman Michael Maguire: [here](#)
- Public Policy and Democracy Studies (PODEM) account of the visit:
<http://podem.org.tr/en/etkinlik/democratic-police-monitoring-and-oversight-mechanisms-study-tour-to-england-and-northern-ireland/>